## OAPT 2022 Public Finance Officers Training Institute HR Best Practices



CONSULTANTS TO MANAGEMENT

Akron | Cincinnati | Dublin | Lima 1.800.282.0787 www.clemansnelson.com



1

## Can I Ask That?

Interviewing Tips and Best Practices



## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
1. Name	Name	Inquiry into any title which indicates race, color, religion, sex, national origin, handicap, age, military status, or ancestry.
2. Address	Inquiry into place and length of current address.	Inquiry into foreign addresses which would indicate national origin.
3. Age	Any inquiry limited to establishing that applicants meet any minimum requirements that may be established by law.	<ul> <li>A. Requiring birth certificates or baptismal record before hiring.</li> <li>B. Any other inquiry which may reveal whether the applicant is at least 40 years of age.</li> </ul>



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

3

## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
4. Birthplace or National Origin		<ul> <li>A. Any inquiry into place of birth.</li> <li>B. Any inquiry into place of birth of parents, grandparents, or spouse.</li> </ul>
5. Race or Color	For applicant flow data.	Any inquiry which would indicate race or color.
6. Sex	For applicant flow data.	Any inquiry which would indicate sex.     Any inquiry made of members of one sex, but not the other.

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

4

## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
7. Religion		A. Any inquiry which would indicate or identify religious denomination or custom.     Applicant may not be told any religious identity or preference of the employer.     Request pastor's recommendation or reference.
8. Disability	Whether applicant can perform the essential functions of the position (before conditional selection). Whether candidate requires an accommodation to perform essential functions (after conditional selection).	Any inquiry concerning need for accommodation (before conditional selection). Any inquiry regarding disability or medical conditions, workers compensation filings, etc.
9. Citizenship	<ul> <li>A. Whether a U.S. Citizen</li> <li>B. If not, whether applicant intends to become one.</li> <li>C. If U.S. residence is legal.</li> <li>D. If spouse is citizen.</li> <li>E. Require proof of citizenship after being hired (I-9 Form).</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>A. If a native-born or naturalized.</li> <li>B. Proof of Citizenship before hiring.</li> <li>C. Whether parents or spouse are native-born or naturalized.</li> </ul>
		© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

5

## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
10. Photographs	May be required after hiring for identification purposes.	Required photograph before hiring.
11. Arrests and Convictions	Inquiries into conviction of specific crimes related to qualifications for the job for which application is made.	Any inquiry which would reveal arrests without convictions.
12. Education	A. Inquiry into nature and extent of academic, professional, or vocational training.     B. Inquiry into language skills such as reading and writing foreign languages.	Any inquiry which would reveal the nationality or religious affiliation of a school.     Inquiry as to what mother tongue is or how foreign language ability was acquired.

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

6

## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
13. Relatives	Inquiry into name, relationships, and address of person to be notified in case of emergency.	Any inquiry about a relative which would be unlawful if made about the applicant.
14. Organizations	Inquiry into organization memberships and offices held, excluding any organization, the name or character of which indicates the race, color, religion, sex, national origin, disability, age, or ancestry of its members.	Inquiry into all clubs and organizations where membership is held.
15. Military Status	For applicant flow data.	In Ohio, Illinois, any inquiry into military service past or present is prohibited. Military status is now a protected class similar to race, sex, and age.
		© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## INTERVIEWING

INQUIRIES BEFORE HIRING	LAWFUL	UNLAWFUL
16. Work Schedule	Inquiry into willingness to work required work schedule.	Any inquiry into willingness to work any particular religious holiday.
17. Other	Any question required to reveal qualifications for the job applied for.	Any non-related inquiry which may reveal information permitting unlawful discrimination.
18. References	General personal and work references not relating to race, color, religion, sex, national origin, handicap, age, military status, or ancestry.	Request references specifically from clergymen or any other persons who might reflect race, color, religion, sex, national origin, disability, age, military status, or ancestry.

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

#### How to Succeed

- Preparation
  - Create a written list of questions that you will ask ALL applicants.
  - Make sure that the job description is up-to-date and that all of the questions asked relate to the essential functions of the job.
  - Create a system for recording the results of the interviews.
  - Review resumes closely
    - · Are there gaps in employment?
    - Are there jobs that ended within one (1) year of
    - Exaggerations?

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

### Post Interview Surveys

- Information provided by applicants will not affect prospects of employment.
- · Were you informed of the essential functions of the job?
- Did the interviewer limit their questions to topics related to the job?
- Were you given an opportunity to describe your knowledge, skills, abilities, and experiences that you have had relative to the job?



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## Post Interview Surveys (cont.)

- Did the interviewer ask you any improper questions?
- Do you feel that the questions asked overall in the interview were fair?
  - If no, why?
- Do you feel that the interview process itself was fair?
  - If no, why?



#### Reference Checks

- Commandment 1: Employers SHALL require applicants to sign a written release when seeking references from individuals.
- Commandment 2: Employers SHALL use caution when providing references to requesting parties.
  - Why?
  - Defamation of character, intentional interference with future business actions, etc.



## **Performance Evaluations**



13

### **Roles of Performance Evaluation**

- Evaluative Role Inform the employee where they stand and what is expected of them
- Developmental Role Informative direction on what the employee can improve upon and how
- · Reward Merit-based pay component



#### What Should be Evaluated

- · Objective standards based on essential functions
- Example of seven (7) appraisal dimensions for nonsupervisory employees and nine (9) for supervisory employees
  - · Quality, Quantity of Work, and Job Knowledge
  - Interpersonal Relations / Teamwork
  - Organization and Planning
  - Decision Making / Problem Solving
  - Verbal and Written Communication
  - Performance Stability
  - Self-Management
  - Supervisory Performance
  - Supervisory Support



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

15

#### What Should Not be Evaluated

- Subjective based on employee traits and characteristics
- Potential what they seem capable of
- · Attitude "poor attitudes"
- Traits and ability level
- Personality
- Outside Factors of which the Employee has NO control - equipment, materials, etc.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

#### Who Should Perform the Evaluation?

- Immediate Supervisor Knowledge of job/first– hand observation
- A Supervisor should focus on identifying performance that meets or exceeds expectations, OR is below expectations and identify ways to improve substandard performance
- A Supervisor should constantly evaluate, both formally and informally, on a regular basis and frequently give feedback

Reminder: Supervisors are evaluated on how they evaluate



## Conducting the Evaluation Interview

- · Plan and prepare for the interview
- Review the job description
- Put the employee at ease explain the tool and its ability to tie into job performance
- · Outline the process to employee
- Go through strengths/weakness as documented



### Conducting the Evaluation Interview

- · During the Interview facilitate communication via:
  - Asking open-ended questions
  - Choose a location/time to limit interruptions
- Conclusion summarize discussion and end positively



## Using the Performance Evaluation to Improve Performance

- · Relate to employee judge v. coach
- Keep performance related to this individual employee
- Diagnose poor performance why is performance substandard? Objective Standards
- Ask for employee insight into performance
- Plan of correction



## Litigation and Privacy Concerns

- · Litigation evaluation used as "evidence"
  - EEO, unemployment, 42 USC 1983 actions, wrongful discharge, defamation, ADA, Administrative Appeals
  - · Exercise care in completing
- Privacy Concerns
  - · Evaluations become public record
  - · Must be accurate and objective
  - · Supervisory notes as a public record



## **Evaluation and Goal Setting**

- · S M A R T
  - Specific
  - Measurable
  - Attainable
  - Realistic
  - Timely



### **Evaluation and Goal Setting**

- Specific
  - · Identify the who, what, where, when, which, and why
- Measurable
  - How much? How Many? How will I know when it is accomplished? Concrete if possible.
- Attainable
  - · It must be within reach
- Realistic
  - · Individual must be willing and able
- Timely
  - · Grounded within a time frame



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

23

23

# Common Problems with Evaluations and Being Prepared (Manager-Related)

- Gaming the system Most employees should be rated as "successfully meets..."
- · Supervisors need the tools
- · Inconsistency across departments/divisions
- · Organization Culture

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

# Common Problems with Evaluations and Being Prepared (Employee-Related)

- One–Way Communication
- Anxiety/Conflict
- Affects the Bottom Line (Merit Based)



## **Dealing with Difficult Employees**

- The employee who is disruptive during the evaluation
- "Will this go in my personnel file?"
- The employee who wants to write a rebuttal
- The employee who continuously wants to compare he/she to another employee
- The employee who refuses to sign
- Secret-recording... (spy pen, mobile phone)



## How Discipline Affects an Evaluation

- Address it at the time of the incident
- Follow progressive discipline
- Support for ratings
- Coaching/counseling vs. formal discipline



## **Purpose of Performance Evaluation**

- Compensation
- Promotion
- Planning
- Training
- Selection
- Increase efficiency
- Set Organizational Objectives



## Corrective Action in the COVID/Post-COVID Era





29

## Corrective Action in the COVID/Post-COVID era

- Labor market significantly different from 10+ years ago
- Employees have more leverage
- Employers may fear losing an otherwise "good" employee
- As terrible as it sounds, better to have some staff...
- But this changed dynamic should not hold us back from accountability...
- ...Why?



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

30

## Corrective Action in the COVID/Post-COVID era (contd.)

 NOTHING will kill a great employee faster than watching you tolerate a bad one.



## Corrective Action in the COVID/Post-COVID era (contd.)

- A recent example...
  - Employee A, a long-time City employee goes on an unprofessional, profane tirade to his new supervisor, who happens to be a well-known, local minister.
    - Employee A to the supervisor: "Keep my f\*cking name out of your mouth." And then some...



### A Recent Example...

- The Union's defense?
  - Swearing frequently goes on and goes unpunished in the department.
  - The Employee was "off the clock" (clocked out and turned around to the supervisor, and stated, "F\*ck you, I'm off the clock!")
  - Witnesses nearby the incident (childhood friends and bargaining unit members) say they "never heard" the statements Employee A made...



## A Recent Example ... (contd.)

- The Employer's argument
  - Tolerating this behavior will have a detrimental impact on the Department
  - Must address out-of-control, aggressive behavior
  - Support the supervisor
  - Change course (yes, swearing goes on, but there is a difference between "shop talk" and degrading statements).



## A Recent Example... (contd.)

- The result?
  - Employer prevailed at arbitration and after the hearing interactions within the department among coworkers, and between bargaining unit employees and the supervisor improved.
  - Cost/benefit of hearing time and expenses was considered, but this hearing was also a matter of principles.



## A Recent Example... (contd.)

- Let's put ourselves in the supervisor's shoes...
  - Local minister;
  - Also ran a hospice ministry;
  - Father:
  - Husband;
  - · High moral principles;
  - African American (Employee A was white);
  - New to the supervisory role and enforcing rules where previous supervisor failed to do so.



## A Recent Example... (contd.)

- What if the Employer did nothing to address Employee A's behavior?
  - Most likely scenario Supervisor resigns;
  - Also likely scenario Other employees see this and also let loose on supervisor, other coworkers;
  - Public Perception.



## Working in Reverse...Begin with the End in Mind

- Just Cause
  - Employer burden to establish it had just cause to discipline the employee/grievant;
  - General concept;
  - $\,\,^{\circ}$  7 Factors the Employer must establish;
  - Work from the beginning (investigation) with just cause concept in mind...



## Working in Reverse (contd.)

- Notice of possible disciplinary consequences for misconduct.
- Was the Employer's rule reasonable? (Related to the orderly, efficient, and safe operation of the Employer's business?)
- Was there an investigation?
- Was the investigation conducted fairly and objectively?
- Did the Employer have substantial evidence the employee violated the rule?
- Has the Employer applied rules evenhandedly and without discrimination?
- Is the degree of discipline reasonably related to the offense?



## Corrective Action or Progressive Discipline

#### **Objectives of Progressive Discipline**:

- Inform employee of what is expected
- Instruct employees on unacceptable conduct
- Interpret policies, rules, and regulations
- Ensure employees act in accordance with policies, rules, and regulations



## Corrective Action Policy Example / Case Study

- We must remind ourselves of its purpose...
- Not solely about individual who is subject of discipline
- Employer's method to create a work environment that fosters mutual respect



### **Types of Corrective Action**

- Reprimands/Warnings (Verbal and Written)
- Suspension with or without pay (Working Suspensions)
- Fines (Vacation)
- Demotion/Reduction
- Removal/Discharge



## Top 4 Items to Understand



43

## #4 - Lack of Understanding of Policies

- Personal Policy Manual
- SOGs/SOPs
- Collective Bargaining Agreement(s)
- Training
- General Knowledge/Practices



### #3 - Lack of Progressive Discipline

- · Punishment Managers think of discipline instead of corrective action (i.e. punish vs. correct)
- Too little, too late Managers focus only on productivity and ignore personnel issues
- Too much counseling without corrective action
- Nuclear options Managers drag their feet on dealing with employee problems; tend to wait until things get so bad they must act - and often, the action they take is extreme
- Not digging deep enough Managers are too busy and often ignore the deeper problem that may be causing the issue
- Taking the matter personally



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

45

## #2 - Need to Know What's Down the Road

- Everyone in the disciplinary process must know what's at stake and what liability looms if the process is not carried out correctly
- This can also ease a manager's mind on the following:
  - What if they file a discrimination claim? How long can it take?
  - What do I do if they get hostile and aggressive?
  - Don't I have to treat each employee exactly the same?

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

46

#### #1 - Communicate!

- Fight the urge to alienate the annoying, marginal, or unpleasant employee
- Do not play "Gotcha"! Nothing should be a surprise!
- Do not let problems fester or assume someone will self-correct
  - Many personnel issues are not self-managing.
- Understand the effect of employee violating rules on morale
  - Inaction by management can do significant harm to the otherwise positive attitudes of good employees.

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

47

#### FORMS OF GENERAL DISCIPLINE

- A. Verbal Instruction/Warning
- B. Written warning
- C. Suspension (Unpaid and working)
- D. Demotion
- E. Discharge

Review the collective bargaining agreement and policies and procedures as each discipline article and policy is slightly different.

48

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## Policy Example and Application First-Line Supervisors (Part 1)

Employers may use an oral and written system to explain work deficiencies and to explain the seriousness of disciplinary matters. Disciplinary matters may range from oral warnings to discharge.

The degree of the discipline may be determined according to how the Employer perceives the seriousness of the offense and the surrounding circumstances.

Many policies do not require the Employer through its management to start all disciplinary action with an oral warning. Some offenses will result in more severe disciplinary action, up to and including discharge, after only one offense. (Make sure to review your policy on this issue.)

Example: Sexual harassment that is substantiated should not be met with a verbal or written warning. (Note – Prompt and effective remedial action.)



## Policy Example and Application First-Line Supervisors Role (Part 2)

First-Line Supervisors are responsible for identifying potential disciplinary matters and reporting them up the chain of command per department policy/reporting procedures.

First-Line Supervisors are therefore responsible for identifying performance issues and conduct of subordinates that may (and I stress may) violate Employer's and/or departmental policies.

First-Line Supervisors are responsible for reporting the issues and conduct by reporting the facts and potential policies violated.

First-Line Supervisors may not be responsible for issuing the actual discipline to be imposed. This will depend on the Employer's policies and practices on the issue.



### **Discipline - Statutory Grounds**

- 1. Incompetency.
- 2. Inefficiency.
- 3. Unsatisfactory performance (newest addition0
- 4. Dishonesty.
- 5. Alcohol/substance abuse.
- 6. Immoral conduct.
- 7. Insubordination.



## Discipline - Statutory Grounds (contd.)

- 8. Discourteous treatment of the public.
- 9. Neglect of duty.

52

- 10. Violation of Employer policy/procedure.
- 11. Malfeasance (wrongdoing or misconduct especially by a public official/ public employee), misfeasance (performance of a lawful action in an illegal or improper manner), or nonfeasance (failure to act; failure to do what ought to be done).
- 12. Conviction of a felony as defined in ORC 124.34.
- 13. Other failure to good behavior.

© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## Policy Example... **Group I Offense Examples**

- In general, Group I Offenses may be defined as those infractions which are of a relatively minor nature and which cause only a minimal disruption to productivity, efficiency and/or morale. Group I Offenses, if left undisciplined by proper authority, will usually cause only a temporary impact against the organization unless such acts are compounded over time.
  - Failure to report off work
  - Failure to commence work at start of shift (Dispatcher readiness for work example)
  - Leaving work early without permission (or making preparations to leave work early and prior to end of shift)
  - Use of profane language (isolated use) (First example of degrading language v. shop talk - know the difference)
  - Distracting the attention of others on the job
  - Carelessness or neglect in signing out.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

53

## Example 2 - Profane language

- Administrator of a Department (only female in the department) regularly uses profanity with subordinates.
- Investigation finds profanity is often degrading and directed toward the lower-level employees.
- Administrator responds that all employees swear, and she should not be treated differently due to being female.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## Example 2 - Profane language (contd.)

- Context is critical...
- Understand the nuances and details of the situation; dig deep to find critical facts.
- In this example...
  - Employees (many) complained.
  - Administrator had a heightened duty to have professional interactions with staff.
  - Employees perceived the language as degrading.
  - Administrator / alleged offender claimed it was shop talk with employees whom she has built a rapport with and she shouldn't be treated differently from others who swear.
  - Key fact: A particularly degrading and offensive comment to a new employee, on his first day of work. No "rapport" would have been established.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

55

## Example 2 - Profane language (contd.)

- Employer completed investigation;
- Discrimination charge filed;
- Risk assessment of ignoring situation?
  - Most likely scenario: Staffing crisis.
  - Continued verbal abuse of employees.
  - Word travels fast... public perception.
  - Concern of continued services.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

## Policy Example... **Group II Offense Examples**

- Group II Offenses may be defined as those infractions which are of a more serious nature than the Group I Offenses and which, in turn, cause a more serious and longer lasting disruption to the organization in terms of decreased organizational productivity, efficiency and/or morale. Group II Offenses, if left undisciplined by proper authority, can cause a more serious and longer lasting impact against the organization than the Group I Offenses.
  - Leaving the job or work area during regular work hours without authorization.
  - Unauthorized absence from work (e.g., unauthorized leave without pay).
  - Discourteous treatment of the public.
  - Reporting for work or working while unfit for duty.
  - Possession or storage of alcoholic beverages on the Employer's premises.
  - Conduct violating morality or common decency.
  - Unauthorized use of Employer property or equipment, or unsafe use or failure to use prescribed safety equipment, or failure to ensure proper use of prescribed safety equipment and/or adherence to safety practices and procedures.
  - Use of abusive or threatening language or gestures toward subordinates, other employees, or the public.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

57

### **Policy Example... Group III Offense Examples**

- Group III Offenses may be defined as those infractions which are of a very serious or possibly a criminal nature and/or which cause a critical disruption to the organization in terms of decreased productivity, efficiency and/or morale. Group III Offenses, if left undisciplined by proper authority, may have a long lasting and serious adverse impact on the organization
  - Falsifying testimony when accidents are being investigated, falsifying or assisting in falsifying or destroying any Employer records, including work performance reports; or giving false information or withholding pertinent information called for in making application for employment.
  - Making false claims or misrepresentations in an attempt to obtain any Employer benefit.
  - Stealing or similar conduct, including destroying or vandalism.
  - The illegal use of narcotics/controlled substances or the sale of narcotics/controlled substances.
  - Drinking alcoholic beverages on the job; reporting for work or working while unfit for duty or intoxicated.
  - Abusing, fighting, or attempting injury to other employees or persons; threatening or intimidating other employees, citizens, or persons.



© 2022 Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.

### Types of Discipline (Part 1)

An employee who violates the common standards of acceptable behavior, the Personnel Policy, work rules and/or operating procedures may be subject to any of the following disciplinary actions (after constructive counseling, if appropriate)

#### A. Verbal Warning/Instruction

A verbal warning may be used as the initial warning for minor offenses. The employee's supervisor will explain the problem to the employee in a private and confidential manner. The objective will be to correct misunderstandings and prevent repetition.



### Types of Discipline (Part 2)

#### B. Written warning

A written warning is more serious than an oral warning. The employee's supervisor will explain that due to a prior warning or due to the severity of the present violation, a written warning is necessary, and a copy will be entered in the employee's personnel file. Employees are instructed to sign the written warning. The employee's signature does not indicate agreement with the facts or consent to the issuance of a written warning, but rather acknowledgment that the written warning has been received by the employee. If the employee refuses to sign as acknowledgement of receipt, another supervisor should witness receipt and refusal to sign.

Usually issued for a second Group I offense



## Types of Discipline (Part 3)

#### C. Suspension

Suspension means the employee may not be present at the workplace unless on official business with the Employer and the employee will usually not receive pay for the duration of the suspension. Suspensions are of two types:

- Working Suspension employee receives suspension level discipline but does not lose pay; must report for work (often used to address chronic attendance–related issues).
- Unpaid Suspension employee receives suspension and is off work for a specified number of days.



### Types of Discipline (Part 4)

#### D. Demotion

Demotion refers to discipline where an employee is reduced to a lower classification and receives an associated pay decrease.

Usually from supervisor to front-line worker.

Discipline level just short of discharge, used to reduce employee to a lower position, usually one in which they had previously been successful.



## Discipline

#### E. Discharge

The employee is discharged/terminated from employment. This level of discipline is administered for the most serious infractions or for continued violation of low-level policies that leads to progressive discipline.



## We must be proactive to avoid problems...

- Making the Office Work Together
  - Understanding your staff and personalities
  - Everyone is different and responds differently to praise, criticism, silence, etc.
- Modeling good behavior / be the example
- · Identifying issues and not avoiding them
- Mentoring
- Note on Hybrid Working Models and application of corrective action
- Etc.



### We must be proactive ... (contd.)

- There is no substitute for good supervision and leadership. Remember the following will assist in this endeavor:
  - Communicate (be honest, transparent, straightforward, etc.)
  - Delegate;
  - Evaluate;
  - Be respectful and professional, always (Example 1 from earlier...);
  - Know CBA, policies and procedures to demonstrate competency;
  - Implement and administer policies; and
  - Strive for consistency where appropriate.



### We must be proactive ... (contd.)

- Quick Steps to proper supervision
  - Don't avoid confrontation
  - Don't overreact and give in to immediate need to address issue within 5 seconds.
    - Only threats, discrimination, health safety issues need to be dealt with on-spot to stop offending behavior
  - Seek advice (don't mistake advice with complaining to coworker about the problem).



## **Questions?**



#### Akron | Cincinnati | Dublin | Lima

1.800.282.0787 www.clemansnelson.com

